### Concrete eaters, bleach drinkers and flat earthers:

## How to defend online research from bogus respondents

Leib Litman, PhD

Co-CEO CloudResearch



# **Rise of Online Research**



... CloudResearch

# **Online Data Quality**

Online Panels in Social Science Research: Expanding sampling methods beyond Mechanical Turk

#### Behavior Research Methods, September 11, 2017

Jesse Chandler, Cheskie Rosenzweig, Aaron J. Moss, Jonathan Robinson, and Leib Litman Assessing the Risks to Online Polls From Bogus Respondents:

> Pew Research Center February 18, 2020

Courtney Kennedy, Nick Hatley, Arnold Lau, Andrew Mercer, Scott Keeter, Joshua Ferno, and Dorene Asare-Marfo Dirty Data: The Effects of Screening Respondents Who Provide Low-Quality Data in Survey Research

Journal of Business and Psychology, September 2, 2017

Justin A. DeSimone & P. D. Harms

## **THREATS TO DATA QUALITY**

#### **Speedster**

- Real Human
- Inconsistent Unengaged Inattentive
- Speeding
- Reward-Focused
- Honest When
  Possible



#### Fraudster

- Dishonest
- Reward-Focused
- Eligible 'For All Studies'
- Often a Speedster



- Human or Machine
- Uses Scripts
  or Code
- Provides Bad Data
- On Continuum
  of

#### Sophistication



#### **Golden Ticket**

- Real Human
- Attentive
- Engaged
- Effortful
- Honest
- Internally Consistent



# **Bogus Respondents, Bogus Conclusions?**





# **Bogus Respondents, Bogus Conclusions?**

#### Do you believe that the world is round or flat?

I have always believed the world is round

I always thought the world is round but more recently I am skeptical/have doubts

I always thought the world is flat, but more recently I am skeptical/have doubts

I have always believed the world is flat



III Cloud Resea

# **Bogus Respondents, Bogus Conclusions?**

FIGURE 2. Cleaning and disinfection practices in the previous month with the intent of preventing SARS-CoV-2 infection,  $*,^{\dagger}$  based on responses to an opt-in Internet panel survey<sup>§</sup> (N = 502 respondents) — United States, May 2020



# Conclusion: "Thirty-nine percent reported intentionally engaging in at least one high-risk practice not recommended by CDC for prevention of SARS-CoV-2 transmission".

Weighted % selecting response

\* In response to the question "In the past month, which of the following cleaning behaviors have you or a household member engaged in to prevent coronavirus?"

# **Traditional Post-Survey Review:**

#### **Post Survey Review**

In-Survey Attention Checks Open End Review Speed of Completion Unrealistic Profiles Total Flags

#### <u>Cons</u>

- Inconsistent across firms and surveys
- Unscientific: How many flags? What is a good attention check
- Very resource/time intensive
- Return to field multiple times
- Complex reconciliation process
- Checks to catch <u>all</u> kinds of bad respondents
- Slower to complete data collection



## What about Pre-Survey Vetting?

Open Access | Published: 11 September 2019

# Online panels in social science research: Expanding sampling methods beyond Mechanical Turk

Jesse Chandler, Cheskie Rosenzweig, Aaron J. Moss, Jonathan Robinson & Leib Litman 🖂

Behavior Research Methods 51, 2022–2038 (2019) Cite this article

14k Accesses | 48 Citations | 26 Altmetric | Metrics

#### Evaluating CloudResearch's Approved Group as a Solution for Problematic Data Quality on MTurk

#### D Hauser, AJ Moss, C Rosenzweig, SN Jaffe... - 2021 - psyarxiv.com

Maintaining data quality on Amazon Mechanical Turk (MTurk) has always been a concern for researchers. CloudResearch, a third-party website that interfaces with MTurk, assessed~ 100,000 MTurkers and categorized them into those that provide high-(~ 65,000, Approved) and low-(~ 35,000, Blocked) quality data. Here, we examined the predictive validity of CloudResearch's vetting. Participants (N= 900) from the Approved and Blocked groups, along with a Standard MTurk sample, completed an array of data quality measures ...

☆ 埦 All 3 versions 🔊

Showing the best result for this search. See all results





#### Sentry: Behavioral + Technological DQ System

9,276 Respondents	8,187 Passed (18.26%)	172 Dropped (185%)		917 (593)   760 Failed (5593)
e Breakdown Analysis	Failure Reason	Туре	Participants	Percentage
Yea-saying Inattentive	🔗 Yea-saying	Failed	437	47.66%
Duplicate IP Address Failed Recaptcha	? Inattentive	Failed	323	35.22%
Location Blocked Translation Detected	Duplicate IP Address	Security Blocked	119	12.98%
Fingerprint Blocked Restricted Device	i Tech Blocked - Recaptcha	Security Blocked	22	2.4%
	Tech Blocked - Location Blocked	Security Blocked	15	1.64%
Participation	AE Tech Blocked - Translation Detected	Security Blocked	1	0.11%
Hestmap di			0	0%
		A A CAL	0	0%
		and a second sec		

### **Semantic Network Model Approach**

Goals:

- Scalability: thousands of instrument items are needed to prevent fraud
- · Difficulty levels based on objective, quantifiable, and adjustable criteria
  - Difficulty quantified based on word frequency and threshold adjustment



Youn, H., et al (2016). On the universal structure of human lexical semantics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(7), 1766-1771.



## Sentry Stimuli

- Question creation and scoring based on associative network models
- Extensive testing, stabilization of optimal difficulty level

Cl	oudResearch"					
Question 1 of 1						
Coll	ect is most associated with					
Α	headline					
В	quarterback					
С	rhythm					
D	gather					

Please select answer to continue

Next -

#### CloudResearch

Question 1 of 1

From memory, can you recall the name of every child of every President in the history of the U.S.?

Α	Yes
В	No
С	I remember them all
D	Completely

Please select answer to continue





# Sentry tech: Event Streamer

?∃ Projects	Assignment: 27fe6602-3135-447e-8b35-01be45287844	×
Accounting	CloudResearch	Leaffet   C MapTiler 289 Longitude: -112.2443
Se Providers	Instructions	ddress:
I Questions	The next few questions ask about your knowledge of the world, and your understanding of words.	print:
Template	For each question, please pick the answer that seems most correct to you.	pre:
Sto Organizations		
差 Admin	Next ⇒	
		2-46b9-84d5- 4
	@ 2021 Prime Research Solutions LLC	e Session Recording
	00:35 03:08	ownload Events CSV
	💷 🔯 2x 4x 8x 💽 skip inactive 🖉	e For
Ke Hide Manu		



## Sentry Results: BLEACH DRINKING?

Conclusion: "Thirty-nine percent reported intentionally engaging in at least one high-risk practice not recommended by CDC for prevention of SARS-CoV-2 transmission".





#### **CLEAN DATA: Concrete Eaters**

**Conclusion: 30% of people eat concrete for breakfast** 





## **DATA CLEANED:** Flat Earthers Conclusion: Only 70% of people in the US are sure the world is round.

#### Do you believe that the world is round or flat?

I have always believed the world is round

I always thought the world is round but more recently I am skeptical/have doubts

I always thought the world is flat, but more recently I am skeptical/have doubts

I have always believed the world is flat

Other/not sure



CloudResea

## **Sentry Results:**

How do respondents who pass Sentry compare to those that don't?





#### **Past Research**

Pres	urvey Sci	reening Po	erformand	e			search Ve
		Estimated	True Status			Presurvey	Postsurvey
IS		Flag	Pass	Total	Accuracy	86%	91%
Scree	Flag	374	215	589	F1 Score	72%	81%
Presurvey Screens	Pass	73	1432	1505	Cohen's Kappa	0.63	0.75
	Total	447	1647	2094	True Positive	84%	92%
					True Negative	87%	90%

- Presurvey screens quarantine 84% of problematic respondents
- Using presurvey screens alone, 95% of the sample is valid
- · False positive rate is nearly equal to full postsurvey review

94		in do i condito	0.70	52/0
		True Negative	87%	90%
ondents Ilid		False Positive	13%	10%
iew		False Negative	16%	8%

13

VERSTA



- All researchers must be aware of the different kinds of Bogus Participants, and use scientific, adaptable methods to keep their data quality high
- Robust Prescreen solutions can remove Low Quality Respondents and Provide Trustworthy Data, in line with leading Post-Survey Methods
- As threats continue to evolve, so must solutions

